

## Message Text

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 01 TEL AV 00728 311536Z

51

ACTION NEA-09

INFO OCT-01 EUR-12 ISO-00 INRE-00 SSO-00 NSCE-00 USIE-00

CIAE-00 DODE-00 PM-03 H-01 INR-07 L-02 NSAE-00 NSC-05

PA-01 RSC-01 PRS-01 SP-02 SS-15 IO-10 /070 W

----- 113036

R 311440Z JAN 75

FM AMEMBASSY TEL AVIV

TO SECSTATE WASHDC IMMEDIATE 5465

INFO AMEMBASSY AMMAN

AMEMBASSY BEIRUT

AMEMBASSY CAIRO

AMEMBASSY DAMASCUS

AMCONSUL JERUSALEM

AMEMBASSY LONDON

C O N F I D E N T I A L TEL AVIV 0728

E.O.11652: GDS

TAGS: PINT, IS

SUBJECT: AGRANAT COMMISSION'S FINAL REPORT

REF: TEL AVIV 1983

1. SUMMARY: GOI HAS RECEIVED 1512 PAGE AGRANAT COMMISSION FINAL REPORT, OF WHICH ONLY SMALL SECTION HAS BEEN MADE PUBLIC, BRINGING TO CONCLUSION 14-MONTH INQUIRY INTO SHORTCOMINGS CONNECTED WITH PREPARATION AND CONDUCT OF OCTOBER 1973 WAR. APPEARANCE OF INALA REPORT CONSTITUTES SOMETHING OF A POLITICAL ANTICLIMAX, WITH EXPECTATIONS OF FRESH POLITICAL REVELATIONS OR NEW CHARGES AGAINST SENIOR POLITICAL PERSONALITIES LEFT UNFULFILLED. DAYAN IS NOT MENTIONED BY NAME; HE HAS BEEN NEITHER EXONERATED AND REHABILITATED NOR FOUND RESPONSIBLE FOR WHAT WENT WRONG, AND HIS POLITICAL FUTURE REMAINS AS UNCERTAIN AS IT WAS BEFORE. ON POLITICAL LEVEL MAJOR CONCLUSION IS URGENT NEED FOR LEGISLATION DEMARCHING WARTIME RESPONSIBILITIES OF CABINET, DEFENSE MINISTER AND CHIEF OF STAFF. REPORT DISCUSSES BROAD RANGE OF IDF SHORTCOMINGS, HIGHLIGHTING  
CONFIDENTIAL

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 02 TEL AV 00728 311536Z

LAX DISCIPLINE, GAPS IN COMMAND COORDINATION, INTELLIGENCE

FAILURES IN FIELD, AND MISMANAGEMENT OF EMERGENCY WAREHOUSES.  
GOI WILL DISCUSS REPORT'S CONCLUSIONS IN NEAR FUTURE.  
RECOMMENDATIONS IN FIELD OF INTELLIGENCE, MADE IN APRIL  
1974 INTERIM REPORT, REPORTEDLY HAVE ALREADY BEGUN TO  
BE IMPLEMENTED.END SUMMARY.

2. AFTER 14 MONTHS, FIVE-MAN AGRANAT COMMISSION INQUIRY INTO  
SHORTCOMINGS PRECEDING AND IN FIRST DAYS OF OCTOBER 1973 WAR  
HAS PRESENTED ITS FINAL REPORT TO CABINET. ALMOST ENTIRE THREE  
VOLUME REPORT, COMPRISING 1512 PAGES, IS SECRET, AND ONLY 43  
PAGES REPRESENTING BROAD GENERALIZED SUMMARY OF CONCLUSIONS  
HAS BEEN MADE PUBLIC. INITIAL PUBLIC COMMENTS AND REACTIONS,  
INCLUDING ASSESSMENTS OF ITS POLITICAL IMPLICATIONS, ARE BASED  
ONLY ON THIS UNCLASSIFIED SECTION OF OVERALL REPORT.

3. IT MAY BE USEFUL TO RECALL THAT PUBLICATION OF INTERIM  
REPORT IN APRIL 1974 CONSTITUTED DRAMATIC POLITICAL BOMBHELL (REF).  
INTERIM REPORT EXONERATED MRS. MEIR, BLURRED ISSUE OF DAYAN'S  
PERSONAL RESPONSIBILITY BY NOT ADDRESSING ITSELF TO BROAD ISSUE  
OF MINISTERIAL RESPONSIBILITY, AND LED TO RESIGNATIONS OF THEN  
CHIEF OF STAFF ELAZAR, CHIEF OF MILITARY INTELLIGENCE ZEIRA AND  
SUSPENSION OF COMMANDER OF SOUTHERN FRONT GONEN. THIS LED  
TO STRONG PUBLIC OUTCRY AT WHAT SEEMED TO BE WHITEWASH OF  
DAYAN, IN TURN PRECIPITATING MRS MEIR'S DECISION TO RESIGN.

4. IN COMPARISON, PUBLICATION OF FINAL REPORT HAS CONSTITUTED  
POLITICAL ANTICLIMAX, DESPITE SPECULATION IN LAST FEW DAYS THAT  
IT ALSO WOULD HAVE DRAMATIC POLITICAL IMPACT. BOTH PRO AND ANTI  
DAYAN CAMPS HAD FUELED THESE RUMORS FOR THEIR RESPECTIVE  
PURPOSES, DRAMATIZING POSSIBILITY THAT AGRANAT REPORT WOULD  
GRANT DAYAN COMPLETE REHABILITATION AND PAVE WAY TO REVIVED  
POLITICAL CAREER. HOWEVER, THERE'S NO SPECIFIC MENTION IN  
PUBLISHED PART OF REPORT TO DAYAN, ALTHOUGH SECRET PART MAY  
INCLUDE SOME REFERENCE. THUS, COMMISSION DOES NOT GO BEYOND  
WHAT WAS LAREDY STATED IN ITS INTERIM REPORT --I.E., THAT  
DEFENSE MINISTER IS NOT SUPER CHIEF OF STAFF NOR RESPONSIBLE  
FOR BATTLEFIELD ACTION DECISIONS. BOTH THOSE WHO EXPECTED  
DAYAN'S REHABILITATION AND THOSE WHO HOPED FOR HIS CONDEMNATION  
ARE DISAPPOINTED. HIS SUPPORTERS WILL PROBABLY NOW CLAIM THAT  
FACT THAT REPORT MAKES NO MENTION OF DAYAN MEANS THAT HE  
CONFIDENTIAL

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 03 TEL AV 00728 311536Z

IS IN THE CLEAR. HIS CRITICS ON OTHER HAND WILL SAY THAT DAYAN  
STILL MUST BEAR RESPONSIBILITY FOR FAILURE TO ANTICIPATE WAR  
AND MOBILIZE RESERVES IN TIME. DAYAN HAS SAID ON SEVERAL  
OCCASIONS THAT HIS NEXT POLITICAL MOVES WILL HAVE TO AWAIT  
FINAL AGRANAT REPORT. NOW THAT IT IS OUT, HIS DOMESTIC  
POLITICAL POSITION REMAINS AS UNCERTAIN AS BEFORE.

5. MORE BROADLY, PUBLICATION OF FINAL REPORT IS

POLITICAL ANTICLIMAX FOR SEVERAL REASONS:(A) IT APPEARS FIFTEEN MONTHS AFTER OCTOBER WAR, AND INTENSE SHOCK OF IMMEDIATE POSTWAR PERIOD HAS DISAPPEARED:(B) TRANSITION FROM MEIR TO RABIN GOVERNMENT ITSELF CONSTITUTED POLITICAL RESPONSE TO PREWAR ANDWARTIME FAILURES, AND (C) REPORTS OFPOLITICAL CONCLUSIONS ARE CAREFULLY CONFINED TO GENERALITIES, AND JEOPARDIZE NEITHER GOI IN GENERAL NOR ANY OF ITS LEADING PERSONALITIES IN PARTICULAR.

6. AGRANTAT REPORT'S MAJOR POLITICAL CONCLUSION, ALTHOUGH HIGHLIGHTED ONLY IN TERSE FASHION, IS THAT BOTH ON OPERATIONAL AND LEGAL LEVEL THERE IS NEED FOR SPECIFIC LEGISLATION TO DEFINE IN UNEQUIVOCAL TERMS RESPECTIVE AREAS OF RESPONSIBILITY OF CABINET, DEFENSE MINISTER AND CHIEF OF STAFF IN TIME OF WAR. HOWEVER, COMMITTEE MAKES NO SPECIFIC RECOMMENDATIONS ON THIS MATTER. ASIDE FROM THIS POINT, HOWEVER,FINAL REPORT SHEDS NO FURTHER LIGHT ON COMPLEX ISSUE OF MINISTERIAL RESPONSIBILITY, AND ASSIDUOUSLY AVOIDS ANY FURTHER JUDGMENTS CONCERNING MAJOR POLITICAL PERSONALITIES.

7. AMONG SENIOR IDF GENERALS WHO HAVE BEEN EMBROILED IN BITTER CONTROVERSY AS TO THEIR RESPECTIVE RESPONSIBILITY FOR MISCONDUCT AND/OR DEFECTSIN CONDUCT OF WAR IN ITS FIRST PHASE, REPORT'S HARSHTEST JUDGMENT FALLS ON GONEN, RECOMMENDING THAT HE NOT BE ENTRUSTED WITH COMBINED LAND FORCES OR ANY PARALLEL COMMAND ON GENERAL STAFF. COMMISSION ALSO REJECTS GONEN'S CHARGES OF FRAUD AND FORGERY IN SUBMISSION OF EVIDENCE REGARDING HIS ROLE IN WAR. REPORTEDLY, GONEN HAS ALREADY STATED HIS DESIRETO REMAIN IN IDF. IN CONTRAST, AGRANAT COMMISSION VINDICATES ARIEL(ARIK) SHARO, SUPPORTING HIS VIEW THAT CERTAIN EXTREME BATTLE CONDITIONS CAN EVEN JUSTIFY OFFICER DISOBEYING ORDERS.

8. IN ITS RECOMMENDATIONS RE IDF'S PERFORMANCE, COMMISSION  
CONFIDENTIAL

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 04 TEL AV 00728 311536Z

STRESSES INTERRELATIONSHIP BETWEEN NEED TO RESTORE MILITARY DISCIPLINE IN ALL INTS COMPONENTS FROM DAILY REGULAR PROCEDURES TO CARRYING OUT BATTLFIELD ORDERS--AND RESTORATION OF PUBLIC CONFIDENCE IN ARMY. MAJOR SHORTCOMINGS WHICH ARE HIGHLIGHTED INCLUDE:(A) LAX DISCIPLINE, (B) FAILURE OF COMMAND COORDINATION, (C) ERRORS OF MILITARY FIELD INTELLIGNECE AND (D) MISMANAGEMENT OF EMERGENCY WAREHOUSES.

9. COMMISSION SO ANALYZED IN GREAT DETAIL MILITARY PREPARATIONS PRECEDING WAR, PUBLIC ATMOSPHERE, DEVELOPMENT OF BATTLES BOTH IN NORTH AND SOUTH AND BEHAVIOR OF COMMANDERS. IN ASSESSING OPERATIONAL WEAKNESSES IN DEFENSIVE STAGE OF WAR (WHICH IN SINAI CONTINUED UNTIL CROSSING OF CANAL ON OCTOBER 14), REPORT OBSERVES THAT ACTIONS AND DECISIONS OF VARIOUS

COMMANDERS, PARTICULARLY IN CRITICAL BATTLE ON OCTOBER 8, STEMMED FROM CLINGING TO PREWAR PRECONCEPTIONS RATHER THAN PRAGMATIC ASSESSMENT OF SITUATION, SOUTHERN COMMAND LACKED CONTROL OVER PROGRESS OF BATTLE AND MISREAD DEVELOPING MILITARY SITUATION.

10. ON FEB 2 CABINET WILL DISCUSS RECOMMENDATIONS OF ZADOK COMMITTEE ESTABLISHED LAST SPRING, AFTER INTERIM REPORT, TO PROPOSE CLARIFICATIONS REGARDING COMPLEX QUESTIONS OF RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN CIVILIAN AND MILITARY AUTHORITIES. IT SHOULD BE NOTED THAT RECOMMENDATIONS OF INTERIM AGRANAT REPORT REGARDING INTELLIGENCE HAVE ALREADY BEEN DISCUSSED AT GREAT LENGTH BY CABINET AND MOST OF THEM REPORTEDLY HAVE ALREADY BEEN ADOPTED.

11. GOI WILL DISCUSS FINAL REPORT IN NEAR FUTURE. SO FAR THERE HAS BEEN NO OFFICIAL COMMENT BY RABIN OR OTHER MINISTERS. PARTY OFFICIALS, POLITICAL COMMENTATORS, AND MILITARY EXPERTS HAVE ALREADY COMMENTED, HIGHLIGHTING FAILURE OF REPORT TO ADDRESS POLITICAL ISSUES, AND NOTING THAT PASSAGE OF TIME ITSELF HAS REDUCED ITS POLITICAL SIGNIFICANCE. RIGHTWING OPPOSITION LIKUD HAS REASSERTED THAT BLAME SQUARELY ON ENTIRE WARTIME POLITICAL LEADERSHIP. IN CONTRAST, MAPAM AND FAR LEFT MOKED HAVE CHARGED THAT DAYAN IS CHIEF CULPRIT. LABOR PARTY LEADERS, SUCH AS SECRETARY GENERAL ZARMI AND CHAIRMAN FOREIGN AFFAIRS AND SECURITY COMMITTEE CHAIRMAN NAVON, HAVE HIGHLIGHTED PROGRESS MADE SO FAR IN CONFIDENTIAL

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 05 TEL AV 00728 311536Z

IMPLEMENTING RECOMMENDATIONS OF INTERIM REPORT AND HAVE REFRAINED FROM COMMENTING ON PERSONALITIES.  
VELIOTES

CONFIDENTIAL

NNN

## Message Attributes

**Automatic Decaptioning:** X  
**Capture Date:** 01 JAN 1994  
**Channel Indicators:** n/a  
**Current Classification:** UNCLASSIFIED  
**Concepts:** REPORTS, OCTOBER WAR  
**Control Number:** n/a  
**Copy:** SINGLE  
**Draft Date:** 31 JAN 1975  
**Decaption Date:** 01 JAN 1960  
**Decaption Note:**  
**Disposition Action:** RELEASED  
**Disposition Approved on Date:**  
**Disposition Authority:** GolinoFR  
**Disposition Case Number:** n/a  
**Disposition Comment:** 25 YEAR REVIEW  
**Disposition Date:** 28 MAY 2004  
**Disposition Event:**  
**Disposition History:** n/a  
**Disposition Reason:**  
**Disposition Remarks:**  
**Document Number:** 1975TELAV00728  
**Document Source:** CORE  
**Document Unique ID:** 00  
**Drafter:** n/a  
**Enclosure:** n/a  
**Executive Order:** GS  
**Errors:** N/A  
**Film Number:** D750036-0737  
**From:** TEL AVIV  
**Handling Restrictions:** n/a  
**Image Path:**  
**ISecure:** 1  
**Legacy Key:** link1975/newtext/t1975011/aaaaaajb.tel  
**Line Count:** 204  
**Locator:** TEXT ON-LINE, ON MICROFILM  
**Office:** ACTION NEA  
**Original Classification:** CONFIDENTIAL  
**Original Handling Restrictions:** n/a  
**Original Previous Classification:** n/a  
**Original Previous Handling Restrictions:** n/a  
**Page Count:** 4  
**Previous Channel Indicators:** n/a  
**Previous Classification:** CONFIDENTIAL  
**Previous Handling Restrictions:** n/a  
**Reference:** 75 TEL AVIV 1983  
**Review Action:** RELEASED, APPROVED  
**Review Authority:** GolinoFR  
**Review Comment:** n/a  
**Review Content Flags:**  
**Review Date:** 25 JUN 2003  
**Review Event:**  
**Review Exemptions:** n/a  
**Review History:** RELEASED <25 JUN 2003 by ShawDG>; APPROVED <26 JUN 2003 by GolinoFR>  
**Review Markings:**

Margaret P. Grafeld  
Declassified/Released  
US Department of State  
EO Systematic Review  
05 JUL 2006

**Review Media Identifier:**  
**Review Referrals:** n/a  
**Review Release Date:** n/a  
**Review Release Event:** n/a  
**Review Transfer Date:**  
**Review Withdrawn Fields:** n/a  
**Secure:** OPEN  
**Status:** NATIVE  
**Subject:** AGRANAT COMMISSION'S FINAL REPORT  
**TAGS:** PINT, IS  
**To:** STATE  
**Type:** TE  
**Markings:** Margaret P. Grafeld Declassified/Released US Department of State EO Systematic Review 05 JUL 2006